2nd Round Votes 0-9 (but accept 8-1 as yellow-bellied kingbird sp.)

Accept

None

Reject

MJI: I stand by first round comments; this does not eliminate other species of yellow-bellied kingbird and it needs to.

ID: Vote to accept as yellow-bellied kingbird sp.

TS: Accept as yellow-bellied kingbird sp.

TLE: For all the reasons expressed by 8/9 members I will reject WEKI but vote to accept Yellow-bellied kingbird spp.

JRT: Probably a yellow kingbird as suggested but I'm not 100% convinced of that and certainly not to species.

MF: Would vote for yellow-bellied flycatcher sp., I guess. Is that really a thing?

SDS: I could accept it as a Yellow-bellied type Kingbird.

WRP: There's nothing in the way of new evidence to cause me to change my vote. While I'm quite certain the observers saw a yellow kingbird, I think the species remains uncertain.

BN: No change of opinion. Would be willing to accept as "yellow-bellied kingbird sp."

1st Round Votes: 1 – 8

Secretary’s Note: There were some expressions of willingness to accept as “Yellow-bellied Flycatcher Sp.” In this second round, please express whether or not you would accept it as such. Thanks!

Accept

TS: Yes

Reject

TLE: Not enough seen e.g. of white on tail, or lack thereof.

MJI: Accept as yellow-bellied kingbird sp., but without white outer tail feathers or other details, I cannot accept a spring bird that does not address Tropical, Couch's, or Cassin's.

JRT

MF: Key field marks not noted.

WRP: While seemingly not an Eastern Kingbird, the description leaves enough doubt about its ultimate identification remains in doubt in my mind.

BN: While I believe they saw a yellow kingbird of some sort, and most likely a Western, the details fail to rule out other possibilities and given the atypical date, I think it best to reject.

SS: While I think she probably had a Western Kingbird, I don’t think there’s enough to cement the ID for this rare spring visitor. Certainly a description of the tail could have helped with the ID, but just not completely convinced at this time. Vote to reject.

ID: Description doesn't definitively ID the bird to a kingbird species. I do believe that it was a non-Eastern kingbird, but the pale wash to the belly seems almost to fit Thick-billed Kingbird as much as anything else.