2nd Round Votes: 4 – 5; Reject as Allen’s; vote whether to accept as Rufous/Allen’s

Accept

MJI: Still comfortable. Not sure why we expect green in r1 for HY male Allen's. For example: <http://www.bigbendnature.com/2011/12/allens-hummingbird-selasphorus-matrix.html>

ID: I still feel that the outer rectrix width points towards ALHU. The look of r4 and r5 is more than just narrow feathers in general, the outer web is extremely narrow and is in my opinion beyond what should be shown by a RUHU. I'm also somewhat of a believer in the worn tawny buff that every currently accepted ALHU in the state (except adult males) has shown.

TS: The tail feathers "seem" ok in the photos. Open for discussion, however. I would have preferred better photos or better yet, measurements in hand.

JRT

Reject

TLE: Still just not enough detail, although we are clearly going to discuss Selasphorus at the meeting; which will be very useful. Accept as male ALHU/RUHU sp.

MF: Still not convinced photos are conclusive.

SS: Certainly willing to discuss, but still not feeling good about accepting this record, especially when another Allen's in the round has some questions and it was banded!

WRP: Despite the overall appearance of the dorsal pattern, the somewhat ambiguous appearance of the rectrices and the known difficulty in distinguishing species in this genus, I need to be convinced that this is an Allen's Hummingbird.

BN: Still not enough evidence for my comfort. And I'm puzzled by ID's comment that "seemingly characteristic worn buff color shown by   
ALHU in MA." Only ALHU in MA show this characteristic?

1st Round Votes: 5 - 4

Accept

MJI: With r5 and r4 that narrow, on an imm male that worn, I am confortable accepting as Allen's, although I acknowledge that this is a liberal stance on what can be interpreted in photos such as these. It is a shame we don’t have banding evidence to really nail this one.

JRT

WRP

TS: Guess so

ID: Identified by rectrice shape plus seemingly characteristic worn buff color shown by ALHU in MA

Reject

TLE: The central rec. bothers me to the point of not being convinced. This is a male. If ALHU then central rec. has green & black on tip for a HY or thin, all red & black tip for an AHY with very reduced black. Not convinced this could not be a HY-M RUHU from what I see here.

MF: What is supposed to be diagnostic in these photos? The outer tail feathers? Not banded, no analysis provided? Similar to the banded bird (2009-57) that experts can't agree on. Photos don't cut it here.

BN: The photos are suggestive, but I don't believe they are conclusive and with no further details I vote to reject.

SS: Vote to reject. While the tail feathers look good for Allen’s, is it enough to confirm Identification of a young bird? Willing to discuss