1st Round Votes/Comments (7-2)

TLE: A

WRP: A; This appears to be a perfect fit for a 1st-cycle Thayer's Gull to me. I vote to accept it without hesitation.

MF: A; A sketchy taxon, but this is as thorough an analysis as we could hope to see.

ID: A; About as perfect as you can get a 1w THGU to look as far as I'm concerned – it looks mostly like a bird with Kumlien's body and almost Herring Gull wings, just what you want.

TS: A; Looks straightforward to me.

SS: A; Good description & photos. Seems like a classic 1st year bird. Vote to Accept.

RS: R; Having seen a few photos of birds like this over the last 7 or so years in MA, I'm still not in agreement as to what to call them.

BN: A; If there is such a thing as a Thayer's Gull, then I guess this is one, but I sure wish this "species" would go away.

JRT: R; This seems on the edge of what we can consider THGU and dark KUGU. I am not comfortable considering these as "identifiable". I have seen many dark KUGU that match this bird and have a hard time believing that they were all THGU. Still, tough!

2nd Round Votes/Comments (7-2)

TLE: A; We all have the same caveats about THGU as a species, but unless we become unique among records committees in rejecting every THGU on principle, this is really well documented and seems to me to be a THGU as opposed to a dark Kumlein's.

WRP: A; About as good a report as one can expect for this cryptic species.

.

MF: A.

ID: A; About as perfect as you can get a 1w THGU to look as far as I'm concerned – it looks mostly like a bird with Kumlien's body and almost Herring Gull wings, just what you want.

TS: A; Committee needs to discuss criteria for Thayer's. This bird would never even be given a second glance in California. If MARC wishes to stop voting on Thayer's and just put all birds in this camp as Thayer's/Kumlien's, we should state that directly. I am not sure these birds are identifiable, but if this one is not, we should re-vote and reject all the others in 1-w plumage.

SS: A.

RS: R; Opinion has not changed.

BN: A; No change.

JRT: R; Well, I remain on the fence here. The bird seems on the pale end in terms of feather darkness to me but I may be trying to pigeon hole an unholable bird. Happy to discuss but as I said in the field birds like this just leave me wondering.